

Annual Report of the Clean Coal Task Force to The Joint Minerals, Business, and Economic Development Interim Committee

September 30, 2012



This Page Left Blank

Annual Report of the Clean Coal Technologies Task Force to the Joint Minerals, Business, and Economic Development Interim Committee

September 30, 2012

(W.S. 21-17-121c)

This report summarizes the activities of the Clean Coal Technologies Task Force for Fiscal Year 2012 (July 1, 2011 – June 30, 2012) along with important updates on some key projects through August 31, 2012. In accordance with original Senate File 15/Senate Enrolled Act 3 (SF15/SEA3) enacted by the Sixty-first Legislature of the State of Wyoming, the Clean Coal Task Force and the Clean Coal Technologies Research Account were renamed the Advanced Conversion Technologies Task Force and the Advanced Conversion Technologies Research Account, respectively. In addition, SF15/SEA3 broadened the scope of the research program to include advanced conversion of other mineral resources along with clean coal technologies and extended the sunset date of the Task Force from June 30, 2013 to June 30, 2017. The effective date of this legislation was July 1, 2012. For the purposes of this report, the Clean Coal Task Force and the Clean Coal Technologies Task Force will hereafter be referred to as the Task Force and the Clean Coal Technologies Research Account/Advanced Conversion Technologies Research Account will be referred to as the Account.

Creation and Appropriations Background

In 2007, House Bill 301 created the Task Force consisting of the current members of the University of Wyoming (UW) Energy Resources Council (ERC). That legislation appropriated \$2.5 million to the Account which could only be expended upon appropriation by the Legislature. The legislation also directed the Task Force to solicit proposals for research in clean coal technologies and required that the appropriation could not be disbursed unless the project demonstrated a dollar-for-dollar match from non-state funds.

The Account was created to stimulate research and development in the area of low-emissions and advanced coal technologies. The objectives of the program are to:

- Enable and accelerate demonstration and early commercial deployment of clean coal technologies that have the potential to enhance and improve the use of sub-bituminous coal at high altitudes, specifically in Wyoming.
- Generate and test new ideas for significant improvement and cost reductions in nextgeneration, low-emissions, and advanced coal technologies.
- Support collaborative research and development (R&D) in accomplishing the above objectives.

The Account supports proposals addressing the following:

- Research and development of new technologies that reduce emissions from coal
- Pilot-scale demonstration of emerging technologies
- Engineering scale-up of demonstrated technologies
- Integration and operation of carbon capture technologies

Chapter 57 of the Legislature of the State of Wyoming's 2009 General Session Law extended the sunset date for the Task Force from June 30, 2010 to June 30, 2013. Section 5 (a) provides that the 2007 general fund appropriation of \$2.5 million into the Account will not revert and can continue to be used for clean coal research. Since 2007, four additional appropriations of funds, each with a reversion date, have been made to the Account (Table 1).

Appropriation	Amount	Reversion Date		
2007 Appropriation	\$2,500,000	No reversion date		
2008 Appropriation	\$3,800,000	June 30, 2012		
2009 Appropriation	\$10,613,047	June 30, 2012		
2010 Appropriation	\$14,000,000	June 30, 2014		
2012 Appropriation	\$10,000,000	June 30, 2016		
Total	\$40,913,047			

 Table 1: Funds Appropriated for Clean Coal Research

FY 2012 Task Force Activities and Developments

Abandoned Mine Land (AML) Funds - Redirected

In the 2012 budget session HB121/HEA25 provided for the submittal of grant applications by the Wyoming Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) to the Federal Office of Surface Mining for future funds and redirection of prior Abandoned Mine Land (AML) fund authorizations. Redirected funds derive from several sources (Table 2) including the Account and the Wyoming Carbon Underground Storage Project (WYCUSP). The redirection of unallocated funds from the 2008 and 2010 appropriations leaves no excess funds in these accounts for the program; however, a combined total of \$318,326 of unallocated funds still remain from the 2007 and 2009 appropriations to be used toward funding additional research (Table 4).

Table 2: Origin of Redirected Funds

Source	Amount
Termination of Ciris Energy Research Project (2009)	\$4,250,139.64
Unallocated from 2008 Clean Coal Appropriation	\$100,014.36
Unallocated from 2010 Clean Coal Appropriation	\$900,000.00
WYCUSP – Unallocated from 2012 Appropriation	\$40,000,000.00
Total Redirected Funds	\$45,250,154.00

The redirected AML funds were appropriated to various programs and agencies of the State of Wyoming. A portion of these funds was appropriated to the University of Wyoming's School of Energy Resources (SER) to fund research projects under the recommendation of the Task Force (Table 3). Each of these programs is discussed in more detail below.

Program Name	Entity Funded	Appropriation
Clean Coal Research	SER	\$10,000,000
Minerals to Value-Added Products Feasibility Study	SER	\$500,000
Commercial-Scale Minerals to Value-Added Products	Governor's	000 000 02
Facility	Office	\$9,000,000
Natural Resources to Manufacture Glass and Glass	SED	\$100,000
Products in Wyoming	SER	\$100,000

 Table 3: AML Funds Reallocated to SER and the Task Force (From HB121/HEA25)

Clean Coal Research (includes updated information through August 31, 2012)

On behalf of the Task Force, SER issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on June 1, 2012 to deploy the newly appropriated \$10 million for clean coal research. Proposals were solicited from academic institutions, private industry and government agencies. Proposals are evaluated competitively by two independent reviewers and judged on the ability to deliver maximum benefit to the State of Wyoming through improved use of and expanded markets for Wyoming's coal resource. To be eligible for funding, the RFP requires researchers to secure and verify a dollar-for-dollar match for the funds requested from the Account. The RFP specified a proposal submittal date of July 13, 2012. Independent reviews were completed for consideration by the Task Force for their August 24, 2012 meeting. At that meeting, the Task Force committed all the remaining Account funds (\$11,050,309) to ten new research projects (Table 4 and Table 11).

Since the beginning of the clean coal research program in 2007, the Task Force has committed funding to 49 projects. The status of these is:

- 9 projects have completed the research, have met all the final reporting requirements and the final invoices have been paid; 5 of these projects have obtained a patent or have a patent pending for their technology
- 7 additional projects were completed by June 30, 2012 and still need to submit the final reports and final invoice
- 2 project contracts were terminated before project completion; both for inability to complete the projects
- 3 projects had awards withdrawn by the Task Force due to the inability to meet the matching requirements or to negotiate a contract
- 21 projects are in progress
- 10 projects are in the process of initiating contracts

Appropriation	Amount
2007 Appropriation	\$2,500,000
2008 Appropriation	\$3,800,000
2009 Appropriation	\$10,613,047
2010 Appropriation	\$14,000,000
2012 Appropriation	\$10,000,000
Subtotal	\$40,913,047
2007 Awards	(\$2,498,222)
2008 Awards	(\$3,699,986)
2009 & 2010 Awards (From 2009 Appropriation)	(\$6,046,360)
2011 Awards (From 2010 Appropriation)	(\$12,368,016)
2012 Awards	(\$11,050,309)
Redirected Funds (From 2008-2011)	(\$5,250,154)
Subtotal	(\$40,913,047)
Remaining Balance	\$0.00

 Table 4. Account Balance

<u>Minerals to Value-Added Products Feasibility Study (includes updated information through</u> August 31, 2012)

During the 2012 budget session, \$500,000 of Abandoned Mine Land funds was appropriated to SER for the purpose of providing grants to conduct one or more studies to determine the feasibility of constructing a commercial-scale mineral to value-added products facility in Wyoming. The objectives of the study were to determine the economic viability of a commercial-scale minerals to value-added products facility, identify potential obstacles to the construction of such a facility, determine the availability of infrastructure and resources for the facility, and identify possible state incentives for development.

An RFP was issued by SER on behalf of the Task Force on April 20, 2012 and 14 proposals were received by the May 25, 2012 submission deadline. On June 18, 2012, the Task Force convened a special meeting to make recommendations for awards to forward to the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee. The following two proposals were selected:

- 1. Western Research Institute, Dr. Vijay Sethi, Principal Investigator, "Distributed Production of Fuels and Chemicals from Stranded Natural Gas," awarded \$162,000.
- Arctech, Dr. Daman Walia, Principal Investigator, "Techno-Economic Analysis of MicGASTM Coal Biorefinery Plants Deployment in Wyoming for Moving Wyoming Coal Up the Value Chain," awarded \$329,243.

Reports for each of the studies were received on August 20, 2012. At the August 24, 2012 meeting of the Task Force, the principal investigators presented summary presentations of their projects.

The Task Force declined to accept the ArcTech, Inc. report. ArcTech, Inc. was advised by the Task Force on how to revise their report in order to achieve acceptability and asked to do so as a priority. Their contract was extended to October 1, 2012. At such time as the ArcTech, Inc. report is accepted, their findings will be summarized and a revised summary report will be amended and re-issued.

Additional information about the projects can be found in Appendix A, which contains a summary report of these studies from the Task Force to the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee.

<u>Commercial-scale Minerals to Value-added Products Facility</u> (*includes updated information through August 31, 2012*)

HB121/HEA25 directed a \$9 million appropriation to the Wyoming governor's office for the purpose of supporting the construction and operation of a commercial-scale facility which converts minerals to value-added products. Applications for these funds are to be received by the Task Force with awards made by the Governor upon receiving recommendations from the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee. Projects applying for these funds must provide a dollar-for-dollar match of funds not from the State of Wyoming.

In a letter dated May 31, 2012 from the Task Force to the members of the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Interim Committee and the Joint Appropriations Interim Committee, the Task Force asked for clarity regarding the legislature's intent and focus with respect to the \$9 million appropriation. The Task Force received a response from the two committees in a letter dated August 3, 2012. The response clarified that the Task Force will not ultimately award grants from this appropriation but will present its recommendations to the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Interim Committee. The committee will then convey its recommendations to the Governor, who will make the ultimate decision on awards. Since the date of the response letter, Task Force Chair Ron Harper has met with Governor Mead about this appropriation. Both agreed that any spending for this effort should be undertaken carefully. Since the \$9 million does not revert until June 30, 2016, there is time for the Task Force, the joint interim committee, the Governor's office and the full legislature to work together to ensure the funds are spent judiciously.

<u>Natural Resources to Manufacture Glass and Glass Products in Wyoming</u> (*includes updated information through August 31, 2012*)

As part of HB121/HEA25, an appropriation of \$100,000 was directed to SER to provide grants to conduct one or more studies to evaluate the feasibility of using Wyoming natural resources to manufacture glass and glass products in Wyoming. Grants authorized from this appropriation are to be awarded by the Task Force and results from any studies are to be reported to the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee by June 1, 2013.

In a letter dated May 31, 2012 from the Task Force to the members of the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Interim Committee and the Joint Appropriations Interim Committee, the Task Force identified four previous studies focusing on the manufacture of glass and glass products in Wyoming. All four studies concluded that the manufacture of glass and glass products is not economically viable in Wyoming. The letter from the Task Force asked for consideration to broaden the scope of the study to the manufacture of other products as well as glass.

In a written response dated August 3, 2012, the two committees concluded that the appropriation could only be expended as stated in the legislation. The letter suggested the Task Force confer with the Governor about options to address this issue, including working with the legislature to possibly broaden the scope of the legislation. In the meantime, the Task Force has suspended any further study on glass manufacturing and will leave the full amount in the account.

Wyoming Attorney General Representation (includes updated information through August 31, 2012)

The Task Force is an entity of the State of Wyoming, and as such, is represented by the Wyoming Attorney General's Office. An Attorney General's representative from the contracts division was assigned to the Task Force and a memorandum of understanding (MOU) was put in place on January 4, 2012 between the University of Wyoming (UW) and the Task Force. The MOU defines the research support services provided by UW to the Task Force in the performance of the Task Force's statutory responsibilities. The MOU was amended after July 1, 2012 to reflect the change in scope and name of the Task Force and the Account as provided in SF15/SEA3. At the August 24, 2012 meeting, the revised MOU was approved for signature by the Task Force.

<u>August 25, 2011 Clean Coal Technologies Fund Research Symposium</u> (*includes updated information through August 31, 2012*)

On August 25, 2011, the first Clean Coal Technologies Research Symposium was held in Laramie, WY to showcase completed clean coal research projects. The day-long symposium showcased 11 projects that were completed by December 31, 2011.

A second Clean Coal Technologies Research Symposium was held August 23, 2012 in Laramie. Approximately 70 people were in attendance to hear from 9 researchers who presented the final results of their projects. The symposium also featured a keynote presentation from Fred Moore, Senior Consultant with Dow Chemical Company. All the presentations were videotaped and are available for public viewing on the SER website

at: http://www.uwyo.edu/ser/conferences/conferences-past/cctf-research-symposium.html

Historical Allocation of Funds for Clean Coal Research

Since 2007, nearly \$41 million has been awarded to 49 research projects (Tables 5-11). The Task Force has focused on funding projects that clearly meet the mandate of benefiting Wyoming's coal resources through the following technology areas specified in the RFP:

- 1. Pre-combustion and pre-gasification technologies
- 2. Combustion and gasification design technologies

- 3. Post-combustion, post-gasification and gas clean-up technologies
- 4. Advanced cycle technologies
- Air separation technologies
 Carbon capture and sequestration technologies
- 7. In-situ gasification technologies
- 8. Coal-to-liquids, coal-to-natural gas and coal-to-hydrogen technologies
- 9. Economic analysis

Table 5. 2007 Funded Projects

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Organization	Project Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
Capture & Mineralization of Carbon Dioxide from Coal Combustion Flue Gas Emissions: Pilot-Scale Studies	UW Dept. of Renewable Resources	\$485,000	\$487,115	Jim Bridger Power Plant	\$972,115	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete Patent obtained or pending
Carbon Capture from Coal Flue Gas on Carbonaceous Sorbents	Supercritical Fluids, Inc.	\$375,000	\$375,000	PacifiCorp, EPRI, Supercritical Fluids, Inc.	\$750,000	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete Patent obtained or pending
Novel Fixed-Bed Gasifier for Wyoming Coals	Emery Energy Company	\$847,500	\$847,549	Emery Energy Co., WRI	\$1,695,049	Combustion & Gasification Design	Complete
Pre-Gasification Treatment of PRB Coals for Improved Advanced Clean Coal Gasifier Design	Western Research Institute	\$398,204	\$399,981	DOE, National Energy Technology Lab	\$798,184	Pre-Combustion/Pre- Gasification Treatment	Complete Patent obtained or pending

Table 6. 2008 Funded Projects

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Organization	Project Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
Development of a New Solid Sorbent for CO ₂ Separation	UW Chemical & Petroleum Engineering	\$250,267	\$253,394	EnviroTech	\$503,661	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete Patent obtained or pending
Geologic Sequestration of CO ₂ in the Rock Springs Uplift (Southwest Wyoming): Experimentation and Modeling of CO ₂ /Brine Relative Permeability, Hysteresis, Permanent Capillary Trapping and Salt Precipitation	UW & Penn State University	\$499,572	\$500,000	UW Research, Penn State University	\$999,572	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete
A Novel Integrated Oxy-Combustion Flue Gas Purification Technology - A Near Zero Emissions Pathway	Western Research Institute (WRI)	\$1,454,552	\$1,454,552	DOE, Southern Co.	\$2,909,104	Combustion & Gasification Design Post-combustion Gas Clean-up;	In Progress
Feasibility of Hydrothermal Dewatering for the Potential to Reduce CO ₂ Emissions and Upgrade Low Rank Coals	EERC/Pavlish	\$59,881	\$59,881	DOE	\$119,762	Pre-combustion Treatment	Complete
Coal Electrolysis for the Production of Hydrogen and Liquid Fuels	Ohio University	\$397,301	\$397,332	Ohio University	\$794,633	Coal-to-liquids/coal-to- hydrogen	Complete
Expenditure correction for estimation error. The difference was made up by SER.		<mark>-\$91,911</mark>					

Table 7. 2009 Funded Projects – First Round

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Organization	Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
Cryogenic Carbon Capture	Sustainable Energy Solutions	\$1,405,744	\$1,405,750	BYU, Illinois CCI	\$2,811,494	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete
Removal of Synthesis Gas Pollutants & Liquid Fuel Synthesis - Part 2	Ceramatec/WRI	\$ 950,000	\$950,393	Office of Naval Research	\$1,900,393	Synthesis Gas Clean- up	Complete
Demonstration of Hydrogen Production from Wyoming Coal	EERC	\$299,986	\$600,000	National Center for Hydrogen Technology	\$899,986	Hydrogen Separation	Complete
Development & Evaluation of Non- Carbon Sorbents	Western Research Institute	\$347,584	\$350,000	Nano-Scale, Amended Silicates, LLC	\$697,584	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete
Extended Operational Runs on Emery Hybrid Gasifier to Accelerate Commercial Adoption	Emery Energy Company	\$1,340,650	\$1,340,650	WRI, Emery Energy Co.	\$2,681,300	Combustion & Gasification Design	In Progress
Supplemental Budget for "Capture & Mineralization of Carbon Dioxide from Coal Combustion Flue Gas Emissions: Pilot Scale Studies"	UW	\$106,382	\$106,382	uw (aml), byu	\$212,764	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete
CO ₂ Sequestration in Depleted Compartmentalized Gas Fields-the Key to Deploying Clean Coal Technology in the Powder River Basin, Wyoming Contract Terminated March 29, 2012	Wyoming State Geological Survey	\$ 183,452	\$500,000	Wyoming Carbon Sequestration Fund (AML)	\$183,452	Carbon Capture & Storage	Terminated
Hydrogen Separation for Clean Coal Applications	WRI	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,004	DOE, Idaho Nat'l Lab, WRI	\$2,000,004	Hydrogen Separation	In Progress

Table 8. 2009 Funded Projects – Second Round.

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Organization	Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
WRI's Pre-Gasification Treatment of Low Rank Coals for Improved Advanced Clean Coal Gasifier Design: Phase I: Pilot-Scale Demonstrations	Western Research Institute	\$ 977,617	\$979,405	Industrial Commission of ND, Montana-Dakota Utilities, EERC, Fuel Cell Energy	\$1,957,022	Pre-Combustion, Pre- Gasification Treatment	In Progress
Innovative Catalytic Gasification Technology to Maximize the Value of Wyoming's Coal Resources	GreatPoint Energy, Inc.	\$ 463,050	\$ 463,050	GreatPoint Energy, Inc.	\$ 926,100	Combustion & Gasification Design	Complete Patent obtained or pending
Reactive Transport of Acidic Brine Resulting from CO ₂ Sequestration in the Rock Springs Uplift (SW Wyoming): Variation of Porosity and Permeability	University of Wyoming	\$ 88,500	\$ 88,500	University of Wyoming	\$ 177,000	Carbon Capture & Storage	Complete
Proposal for Clean Coal Technology Research Contract Terminated August 8, 2011	Ciris Energy, Inc.	\$ <mark>4,836,898</mark> \$586,758	<mark>\$4,836,898</mark> \$586,758	Ciris Energy, Inc.	<mark>\$</mark> 9,673,796 \$1,173,517	Combustion & Gasification Design	Terminated

 Table 9. 2010 Funded Projects

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Organization	Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
The Engineering Scale-Up of Hydrogen Separation Facilities	Western Research Institute (WRI)	\$1,100,000	\$1,519,998	DOE, Chart, Synkera	\$2,619,998	Coal-to-Hydrogen	In Progress
Testing of an Advanced Dry Cooling Technology for Power Plants in Arid Climates	Energy & Environmental Research Center	\$500,000	\$600,000	DOE, EPRI	\$1,100,000	Post-Combustion	In Progress
Evaluation of Novel Technologies for CO ₂ Capture; Neustream-C System	Energy & Environmental Research Center	\$280,156	\$1,697,683	DOE, NPPD, EERC	\$1,977,839	Carbon Capture & Storage	In Progress
Pilot-Scale Testing Evaluations of the Effects of Bromine Addition on CMMs at Low Mercury Concentrations	Energy & Environmental Research Center	\$150,000	\$226,156	DOE, CATM, EPRI	\$376,156	Post-Combustion	Complete
Efficient Coal to Hydrogen System	TDA Research	\$340,000	\$340,000	Pall, CSIRO, CSM, TDA Research	\$680,000	Coal-to-Hydrogen	In Progress
Development of Compact Heat Exchange Reactor for F-T Synthesis	WRI	\$450,000	\$600,200	WRI(DOE), Chart	\$1,050,200	Advanced Cycle Technologies	In Progress
Modular Fischer Tropsch for Wyoming Coal-to- Liquid Fuels	Ceramatec	\$596,105	\$596,105	WRI(DOE), Ceramatec	\$1,192,210	Coal-to-Liquids	In Progress
Use of Historic Wyoming Field Test Data to Validate & Calibrate a Comprehensive Underground Coal Gasification Simulator Award Withdrawn – Couldn't meet match requirement	Lawrence Livermore National Lab	<mark>\$500,000</mark> \$0.00	<mark>\$1,643,827</mark> \$0.00	DOE	\$2,143,827 \$0.00	In-Situ Gasification	Award WIthdrawn
Conceptual Design of a System for Treating Formation Waters Produced as Part of Geologic CO ₂ Sequestration Operations in Wyoming Award Withdrawn – Couldn't meet match requirement	Lawrence Livermore National Lab	<mark>\$500,000</mark> \$0.00	<mark>\$600,000</mark> \$0.00	NETL	<mark>\$1,100,000</mark> \$0.00	Carbon Capture & Storage	Award Withdrawn
Retrofit Impacts of Oxy-coal Combustion of PRB Coal on Deposit Formation & Mercury Speciation	University of Utah	\$540,691	\$540,691	Univ of Utah, Praxair, DOE	\$1,081,382	Post-Combustion	In Progress
Reactive Transport of Acidic Brine Resulting from CO ₂ Sequestration in the Rock Springs Uplift (SW Wyoming): Variation of Porosity and Permeability	University of Wyoming	\$100,000	\$100,000	University of Wyoming	\$ 200,000	Carbon Capture & Storage	In Progress
Low Cost Route to Commercial Iron FT Catalysts for CTL & BTL	BYU	\$420,004	\$420,009	Research Consortium	\$840,013	Coal-to-Liquids	In Progress

Table 10. 2011 Funded Projects

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match	Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
		Requested	Maton	oouloc	T unus		Olulus

Advanced Technology for Cleaning Sour Syngas with Capture of CO ₂ Award Withdrawn – No Contract Issued	Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.	<mark>\$731,984</mark> \$0.00	<mark>\$731,984</mark> \$0.00	Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.	\$1,463,968	Post-Combustion Gas Clean-Up	Award Withdrawn
Advancement of Chemical Looping Combustion with Oxygen Uncoupling	University of Utah	\$446,292	\$446,292	University of Utah, DOE	\$892,584	Combustion & Gasification Design	In Progress
Coal-Derived Warm Syngas Purification and CO ₂ Capture- Assisted Methane Production	Pacific Northwest National Laboratory	\$1,205,596	\$1,205,596	DOE	\$2,411,192	Post-Combustion Gas Clean-Up, Carbon Capture, Coal-to-Natural Gas	In Progress
Pilot Scale Demonstration of MicGAS Coal Biotechnology for In Situ Biological Gasification of Unmineable Wyoming Sub- Bituminous Coals	ARCTECH	\$499,924	\$500,000	ARCHTECH	\$999,924	In-situ Gasification	In Progress
Pore-to-Core-to-Reservoir Modeling of Geologic Storage of Supercritical CO ₂ in Deep Fractured Saline Aquifers	University of Wyoming	\$1,407,900	\$1,407,934	Brazilian National Lab for Scientific Computing	\$2,815,834	Carbon Capture & Storage	In Progress
Multi-Stage Processing of WY Coal-to-Liquid Fuels	Thermosolv, LLC/ Western Research Institute (WRI)	\$500,000	\$500,000	AmbreEnergy, WRI	\$1,000,000	Coal-to-Liquids	In Progress
Development of a Novel Helical Channel Reactor for Syngas Conversion	AmbreEnergy/WRI	\$720,000	\$740,000	AmbreEnergy, WRI	\$1,460,000	Post-Combustion, Gas Clean-Up	In Progress
Novel Carbon Capture Technology Development for Power Generation Using Wyoming Coal	University of Kentucky	\$744,780	\$745,000	Los Alamos National Lab CERC, Univ of Kentucky	\$1,489,780	Combustion, Gasification, Carbon Capture & Storage	In Progress
Skid-Scale, Cryogenic Carbon Capture	Sustainable Energy Solutions	\$2,513,237	\$2,513,237	Sustainable Energy Solutions, Jiaotong Univ, China, WRI	\$5,026,474	Carbon Capture & Storage	In Progress

Table 11. 2012 Task Force Recommended Projects

Proposal Title	Submitted By	Funding Requested	Outside Match	Outside Match Source	Total Funds	Technology Areas	Project Status
Advanced Solvent for CO ₂ Capture and Separation Technology for CO ₂ Sequestration to Enhance Utilization and Reduce Emissions from Wyoming Coal	University of Kentucky	\$686,032 * \$300,000	\$694,614 (potentially subject to change)	West Virginia CERC/Univ of Kentucky Research Foundation	\$1,382,646 To be determined	Carbon Capture & Storage	Contract Initiation
Demonstration of Pilot-Scale Hydrogen and CO ₂ Separation Membrane Technology on Wyoming Coal-Derived Syngas	EERC	\$450,000	\$1,315,000	Praxair	\$1,765,000	Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Engineering Demonstration of a Modular Fischer-Tropsch for Wyoming Coal-to-Liquid Fuels	Ceramatec	\$2,491,710	\$2,491,712	Ceramatec	\$4,983,422	Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Energy Storing Cyrogenic Carbon Capture	Sustainable Energy Solutions	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000	DOE/ARPA-E, CCSEM	\$6,000,000	Post-Gas Clean-Up, Carbon Capture &Storage	Contract Initiation
Pilot-Scale Demonstration of Catalytic Wyoming Coal Gasification and Syngas Processing (Diesel Production) Technologies	University of Wyoming	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000	FMC, SIDCOM, WRI, CERC, West Virginia University	\$2,000,000	Combustion, Gasifier Design, Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Testing and Feasibility Study of an Indirectly Heated Coal Gasifier	Emery Energy	\$603,494 ** \$387,481	\$976,550 (potentially subject to change)	University of Utah, Emery Energy, Kiverdi	\$1,580,045 To be determined	Combustion, Gasifier Design, Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Evaluation of Staged Oxyfuel Combustion for CO ₂ Capture	Washington University, St. Louis	\$479,651	\$479,657	Washington University Clean Coal Consortium, WU School of Engineering	\$959,308	Combustion, Gasifier Design, Carbon Capture & Storage	Contract Initiation
Advanced Polygeneration Platform: Optimizing Oxy-Combustion Burner for Utilizing PRB & GRB Coals	LP Amina	\$1,770,000	\$1,770,000	LP Amina	\$3,540,000	Combustion, Gasifier Design, Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Fischer-Tropsch Conversion of Wyoming Coal-Derived Syngas Using a Small Channel Reactor for Improving Efficiency and Limiting Emissions	University of Kentucky	\$988,136	\$989,322	University of Kentucky, Chart Energy & Chemical	\$1,977,458	Coal-to-Liquids	Contract Initiation
Validation, Modeling & Scale-Up of Chemical Looping with Oxygen Uncoupling	University of Utah	\$183,332	\$184,000	CPFD Software, University of Utah	\$367,332	Combustion, Gasifier Design, Carbon Capture	Contract Initiation
	Totals	\$11,050,309	\$11,585,856+		\$22,636,165		

* The Task Force felt this proposal was really comprised of two distinct research efforts and decided to only fund the enhanced water recovery portion of the research in the amount of \$300,000. University of Kentucky may choose to revise their match; however it cannot be less than \$300,000.

** This project is a follow-up to a currently on-going study funded by the Task Force in 2009. The 2009 project is currently behind schedule; therefore, the Task Force recommended partial funding of this project in the amount of \$387,481.

+ Assumes projects with a reduced award provide the originally proposed amount of outside match.

Appendix A

Report of the Advanced Conversion Technologies Task Force (Task Force) To the Joint Minerals, Business and Economic Development Interim Committee

Minerals to Value Added Products Facility Feasibility Study Report Summary

September 1, 2012

Introduction

In the Sixty-First Legislature of the State of Wyoming 2012 Budget Session, House Bill No. 0121, House Enrolled Act No. 25 was passed by the full Legislature and signed into law by Governor Mead. This legislation appropriated \$500,000 in Abandoned Mine Land (AML) funds to the School of Energy Resources (SER) and authorized studies to identify:

- Whether a commercial scale facility which converts minerals to value added products would be economically viable in Wyoming given projected energy prices and regulatory trends:
- Attributes unique to the state of Wyoming which mitigate for and against construction of a commercial scale minerals to value added products facility in the state;
- The best available technologies for the commercial scale conversion of minerals to value added products in Wyoming;
- Potential obstacles to the construction of a minerals to value added products facility in Wyoming and possible strategies to address those obstacles, including, but not limited to the following:
 - ✓ Regional and national political climate;
 - ✓ Economic issues;
 - ✓ Regulatory issues; and
 - ✓ Transportation.
- Potential input sources of minerals and water for the facility and potential markets for the final value added product and any other products created during the conversion process; and
- Whether, and at what level and in what form, state support is necessary for the development of such a project. The study shall identify possible state incentives available for the construction of a commercial scale minerals to value added products facility and determine which incentives are likely to have the most benefit to industry and the citizens of the state of Wyoming.

Advanced Conversion Technologies Task Force

The Advanced Conversion Technologies Task Force (Task Force) issued a Request for Proposals on April 20, 2012 seeking submissions from principal investigators to conduct studies described above. Proposals were due to the School of Energy Resources (SER) by May 25, 2012. Fourteen proposals were received from thirteen organizations. A total of \$2,471,241 was requested. Ten reviewers evaluated two or three proposal each.

On June 18th, the Task Force met in special session and approved the following two studies:

- Western Research Institute received \$162,000 for "Distributed Production of Fuels/ Chemicals from Stranded Natural Gas."
- ArcTech, Inc. received \$329,243 for "Techno-Economic Analysis of MicGASTM Coal Biorefinery Plants for Deployment in Wyoming."

Reports for each of the studies were received on August 20, 2012, and the principal investigator for each study presented an overview to the Task Force on August 24, 2012. The Task Force voted to accept the Western Research Institute (WRI) report as complete, and findings of the report are summarized below. A copy of the complete report is attached.

The Task Force declined to accept the ArcTech, Inc. report. ArcTech, Inc. was advised by the Task Force on how to revise their report in order to achieve acceptability and was asked to do so as a priority. Their contract was extended to October 1, 2012. At such time as the ArcTech, Inc. report is accepted, their findings will be summarized and this report will be amended and re-issued.

Summary of WRI Report: "Distributed Production of Fuels/Chemicals from Stranded Gas"

The authors of the WRI report made several basic assumptions for design of a modular processing plant at the proposal stage. These were:

- Cost the maximum plant cost could not exceed \$100 million
- Capacity the output capacity of the plant would be 150 barrels per day (bpd) of product, or largest capacity possible that does not trigger EPA oversight. (Following their discussions with DEQ this ended up being around 500 bpd)
- Siting siting of the plant would avoid federal lands. The plant would be sited on private property only when the resource owner holds an equity position in the plant.
- Product the plant will produce a fungible product (gasoline, olefins, diesel in that order.)

The plant proposed in this study is configured as a compact, modular process that can be assembled at a fabrication shop and delivered to a natural gas field requiring minimal field assembly. Conversion is carried out without expensive oxygen and with minimal water consumption. Advanced controls allow remote operations and process control of a single or distributed set of units by a remotely monitored, semi-automatic control station to produce and store the product. Modular design will also allow field replacement of components such as desulfurization modules and reactor modules. Refurbishing of gas clean-up modules and catalyst reloading/regeneration is similarly affected in central facilities. Small modular units reduce manufacturing costs and provide scalability.

WRI coined the term Wyoming Stranded Gas (WYSG) to define the resource for the study. WYSG refers to natural gas reserves that are impeded from getting to market by either physical or economic hurdles. With the local price of natural gas at or below \$3.00/Mscf, all of Wyoming's natural gas could be considered economically stranded. Wyoming coalbed natural gas (CBNG), because of its higher production cost, is especially stranded.

Historically on an energy content basis, gas prices and oil prices have been linked. Increased shale gas, associated natural gas, and CBNG production have created an abundant supply of marketable natural gas which has resulted in delinking of the gas and oil prices. Excess production will likely keep the prices low into the foreseeable future.

A major product from refining of crude oil is fuels for the transportation sector. The transportation sector in the United States currently makes no significant use of natural gas. Lower resource prices represent a major incentive for conversion of natural gas to transportation fuels (gasoline and diesel) and to petrochemicals. The process is called gas-to-liquids (GTL).

Large facilities, such as Shell's Pearl GTL plant under construction in Qatar has an estimated capital cost of \$24 billion and a capacity of 140,000 bpd, are not suited for Wyoming due to limits in the availability of:

- Natural gas feedstock
- Process water
- Work force
- Market

Smaller (±500 bpd), modular plants are far more suited to the attributes unique to Wyoming. Such plants are appropriate for monetizing WYSG for the following reasons:

- A plant can be assembled at a fabrication shop and delivered to a natural gas field requiring minimal field assembly.
- Advanced controls will allow remote operations and process control of single or distributed sets of units at a remotely monitored, semi-automatic control station. This will apply to both production and storage of the product.
- Modular design will also allow field replacement of components such as desulfurization modules and reactor modules, and refurbishing of gas clean-up modules and catalyst reloading/regeneration units.
- Small modular units reduce manufacturing costs and provide scalability.

Plant sizes as small as 150 bpd can be made profitable. Facilities in the range of 500 bpd to 2000 bpd could be located on gathering facilities or gas compressor stations.

For this study, WRI evaluated GTL conversion to gasoline. Their plant configuration has the following attributes:

• No air separation unit is required. Their design uses steam/methane reforming and can accept elevated levels of CO₂ and is thus suited for CBNG.

- No recycle. Tail gas rich in hydrogen is used for reforming (lower carbon emissions).
- Compact reactors that result in a smaller plant footprint.
- Integral water treatment for water reuse that results in the consumption of one bbl of water for each bbl of product.
- Integration of proven technologies.
- Product is shipped in tanker trucks.
- The market is refineries in WY, CO and MT for:
 - ✓ Gasoline blending
 - ✓ Diluents for heavy oil in Canada
- Product fetches a \$5 to \$23/bbl premium over West Texas Intermediate (WTI). For present day WTI at \$89/bbl, the product price is in the \$94 \$112/bbl. Similar or better spreads are expected for diesel production.

Simple economics show that a 500 bpd plant is estimated to have a capital cost of approximately \$40 million, and the payoff is calculated to be around 9 years. Multiple units and centralized control and servicing centers improve profitability substantially.

Process simulation shows that 500 bpd will need about 10 MMcf/d of natural gas. Smaller GTL plants in Wyoming can be operational in 3-5 years whereas larger facilities will take considerably longer. Smaller facilities are easier to permit as they fall below many of the critical emission limits. A 500 bpd GTL plant could be classified as a minor source.

The WRI report provides details for required oversight and permits. The following is a brief list of requirements.

- OSLI Special use lease for siting GTL facilities on state land
- DEQ-AQD minor source permit
- DEQ-SHWD Although not a major producer of solid waste oversight required
- DEQ-WQD General Permit Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan
- SEO Permit to appropriate ground water or surface water
- County Zoning Specific to individual county potential zoning requirements

Potential hurdles for permitting exist where the statutes are either silent or vague as far as they would affect GTL facilities. These include:

- OGCC: Need to clarify whether the GTL process and facilities are subject to the Oil and Gas Act, providing that such processes are not considered part of the natural gas operations or production
- OGCC: Need to clarify whether OGCC has authority to regulate the sale of natural gas from the producer directly to the end user
- PSC: Provide a statuary exemption that the PSC does not have authority to oversee the sale of natural gas to GTL facilities
- DEQ-AQD: Consider assumption of state primacy over the PSD permitting program for greenhouse gas emissions, currently regulated by the EPA.

OSLI – Office of State Lands and Investments DEQ – Department of Environmental Quality (WQD – Water Quality Division; AQD – Air Quality Division; SHWD – Solid and Hazardous Waste Division) SEO- State Engineer's Office OGCC - Oil and Gas Conservation Commission PSC – Public Service Commission PSD – Prevention of Significant Deterioration EPA – Environmental Protection Agency

Finally, WRI suggests potential incentives and recommendations for encouraging GTL conversion in Wyoming. Chief among these are:

- The state should consider a severance tax exemption by reducing or eliminating the severance tax for natural gas consumed by the plant. This would incentivize new technology development and implementation.
- To attract investment in small-scale GTL in Wyoming, consider a sales tax exemption or reduction for a number of years to help developers recoup construction costs sooner.
- The state should consider direct investment in a pilot or first commercial facility. Such a facility can be used for process refinement for efficiency improvements and for work force development and education.